The Political Conflict Trap: The Political Consequences of Civil Conflict

Scott Gates
Centre for the Study of Civil War, PRIO
Norwegian University of Science & Technology

Presentation for Statsviterkonferansen, Bergen

18 April, 2012
Introduction

- The *Economist* December 2010: “Despite a recent flurry of elections, true democracy is still a rarity in the Arab world”

- Will the ‘Arab Spring’ bring democracy to the Middle East?
The Surprising Stability and the Surprising Change

- Until recently explaining “Arab Exceptionalism” was a growth industry.
- Arab regimes were stable and long lived.
- Dominant theories of civil war and political stability predicted unrest in the Middle East, but we found stability.

- Then came the ‘Arab Spring’.
Predicting Revolutions

- Revolutions appear out of the blue – but in retrospect look inevitable
- Private vs. Public preferences (Kuran)

Building on Kuran we argue:
- Regimes have an incentive to induce preference falsification as it is a self-reinforcing process
- This complicates civil society coordination and mobilization
- Regimes induce this through various forms of repression
- In situations with “revolutionary potential” this threat of repression is discounted and people’s true preferences are revealed
- In addition a “band-wagon” effect may make the shift seem greater than it actually is
The first Wave of Semi Democracy? or a democratic ripple (Tunisia)?

Figure: Regime Types, Rest of World and MENA
Exceptionally Durable?

Figure: Regime Longevity Relative to MENA, by Regime Type and Region
Why Not Unstable? Institutionally Inconsistent Regimes
Arab Exceptionalism

Figure: Executive recruitment, constraints and popular participation

Gates (2012)
Explaining the Exceptionalism
Opportunity and Will to Survive: The Role of Rents

- Rents make regimes grow insulated from civil society
- Creates “Garrison States” which can only deal with civil society through force (Gurr 1971)
- MENA states among the most repressive in the world
- Repression, however, is costly
- Most states are not able to repressive indefinitely
No Taxation No Representation

- Oil is characterized by limited lootability
- Oil rents insulate the state from civil society
- States do not provide social safety nets (extended families)
- The state is severely limited
State Development, Resource Rents, and Regime Stability

- Mehlum, Moene & Torvik: Resource Curse – Institutions matter

- Special nature of state development in Middle East:
  - Muslim conquest
  - Religious and military actors ally (Chaney 2012)
  - Weak civil society
  - Natural resource wealth
  - Induces states to grow “fierce” or “hard”, but not “strong” (Ayubi 1991)
Civil Conflict and Regime Stability
A Political Conflict Trap

- Globally Semi Democracies win around 15% of insurgencies
- In MENA they win almost every time
Figure: Political repression increases substantially in the wake of conflict
Political Conflict Trap – Securitization

- Conflict leads to securitization and political exclusion
- Oppositional voices are repressed
- which makes violent opposition the sole means of protest
- Riots & social fragility
- which in turn is met with more repression and political exclusion
- This is a vicious circle that has demonstrably led to renewed conflict

Gates (2012)
Mechanisms

- Cooptation vs Repression
- Oil allows for elite cooptation
- No taxation and forms of limited political access
- No zero sum game between the groups
After the Arab Spring

- The Arab Spring basically saw a shuffling of elites
- Political leaders and security apparatus is a coalition (Svolik)
- What happened in the revolution in Tunisia and Egypt – military joins with civil society
Smart Repression

Figure: The Sovereign’s Transgression Game

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S Moves first</th>
<th>Induced subgame between A and B (payoffs: S, A, B)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transgress</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acquiesce</td>
<td>0, 2, 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenge</td>
<td>8, 1, 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Not Transgress | A                              | B                        |
| Acquiesce      | 2, 8, 8                         | 2, 8, 7                  |
| Challenge      | 2, 7, 8                         | 0, 7, 7                  |
Conclusion

- Why are there so many Semi Democracies in the MENA region?
- Durability
- Win wars
- Fierce states, but not strong states
- Oil serves as the fuel to maintain Semi Democracies